Understanding Methane Supplements

Ainslie Macdonald - Research Fellow

Primary Industries Climate Challenges Centre







THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE

Acknowledgment of country



Source: AIATSIS Indigenous map of Australia



Overview



- Why is methane produced and why is it a problem?
- **How** is methane impacting the sustainability of farms?
- What is driving the need for methane supplements?
- What are methane supplements and who makes them?
- **How** effective are they?
- What are the impacts of their production and use?
- Where is research heading next?
- **How** will methane supplements fit into the farm systems of the future?

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®







Next steps



Fonterra

• Climate-neutral growth to 2030 for pre-farmgate emissions from a 2015 base year

Unilever **

• Reducing the GHG impact of their products by 50% by 2030, compared to baseline of 2010

Mondelez

- Reduce absolute GHG from manufacturing 15%
- 100% renewable energy

Nestle **

• Zero environmental impact in our operations

JBS

• Net-zero GHG by 2040 and zero deforestation across its global supply chain by 2035

Heineken

• Carbon neutral barley-malt supply chain

Rabobank & NAB

- Net zero financed emissions by 2050
- Hold 50% of Australia agri-debt market

Mars

2050 (from 2015 levels)

Kellogg Company **

- 65% reduction by 2050
- 100% renewable energy

Pfizer

• 60 to 80% by 2050

Wilmar international

- 89.72% less GHG from 2013 to 2020 • 100% renewable energy

Olam

- Reduce GHGs by 50% by 2030 both in our own operations and in our supply chain
- By 2050, we aspire to be carbon positive in operations, requiring a 5% emissions reduction per year from 2031 -
 - 2050

Asparagopsis

Source: Company sustainability reports https://oxfamapps.org/fp2p/the-worlds-top-100-economies-31-countries-69-corporations/

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®



• Reduce GHG across our value chain 27% by 2025 and 67% by

** committed to increasing plant-based protein

Next steps



International drivers

USA: President Joe Biden

- "Failing to curb emissions means America will tax your exports"
- "to ensure his climate policies do not place US workers and companies at an unfair disadvantage" – Financial Times 26 April 2021

The EU's Carbon Border Adjustment Mechanism (CBAM)

- "The European Parliament... approval to... start taxing imports from countries without a carbon price... by 2023" – Financial Times 11 March 2020
- Initially not applied to agriculture but reviewed in 2026
- Other GHG compliance barriers already exist

Around 70% of Australian Agricultural product is exported

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®







Next steps





Greenhouse gases

- The greenhouse effect was first observed by Eunice Foote in 1856
- Greenhouse gases absorb heat and are able to trap the suns heat to maintain the right environmental conditions for life
- e.g. CO2, water vapour, CH4, O3, CFCs
 - But increases in GHGs increases the amount of heat that is absorbed into the atmosphere

Source: Carlyn Iverson/NOAA Climate.gov and NASA



The "solution"

Bovaer®









Next steps



Methane (CH4) production

- Microbes digest feed in the rumen through anaerobic fermentation
- Fermentation produces Volatile Fatty Acids (VFAs) and CO2 and H2 gas
- Methanogenic archaea (methanogens)
 convert the by-products of fermentation
 into methane
- Methane is then eructated (burped) out
- This process evolved ~50M years ago
- Trying to change this in 30 years is difficult
- Adaptation to mitigants is a challenge



Source: Hackmann & Spain (2010), Zhao (2020)

The "solution"

Bovaer®





Next steps



Methane (CH4) potency

- Methane only has a lifespan of 8-12 years (CO2 is 100s-1,000s of years)
- Methane is oxidised by OH radicals
 - The global warming potential of Methane
- 28 times greater than CO2 over 100 years
- 82 times greater than CO2 over 20 years
 - CH4 is very good at absorbing radiation!!!
 - Historically the volume and potency have made methane a problem
 - BUT now reducing methane is seen as a solution because the impact is

The "solution"

- Instant
- Significant
- Achievable

Source: IPCC AR6 Summary for Policymakers

The problem

Bovaer®

c) Contributions to 2010-2019 warming relative to 1850-1900, assessed from radiative



Carbon dioxide	Methane	Nitrous oxide





Next steps



Methane reducing technology

Animal breeding

- Productivity
- Volume of methanogenic archaea
- Rumen passage rate



Richardson et al. 2021; Pickering et al. (2015); Pinares-Patiño et al. (2013); Cabezas-Garcia et al. (2017); J. Lassen (Viking Genetics); Beauchemin, Ungerfeld, Eckard and Wang (2020); Barwick et al. (2019) Moate et al. (2011)

Diet

- Forage digestibility
- Energy density of diets
- Secondary compounds
- -Oil (1% =~3.5% reduction)
- -Tannins 10-15% reduction
- Essential Oils 10-30% reduction



The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





Supplements

- Bovear
- Asparagopsis





Next steps





• aka 3-nitrooxyporopanol aka 3-

NOP

- Made by DSM
- Methane inhibitor
- Synthetic analogue for Methyl coenzyme M
- Metabolised to form nitrite, nitrate and 1,3-propanediol, and then 3-hydroxypropinoic acid22



Source: Yu, 2021

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





Next steps





- Number of studies: 31 in vivo, 20 in vitro and 9 in silico
- **Cost:** 30c-50c per cow per day (~1g)
- **Method of delivery:** mixed in with feed (consistently), or pellets before or after feeding
- Efficacy: 30% (50-80mg/ kg DMI)
- **Optimal dosage:** 125-150mg 3-NOP/ kg DMI
- Availability: Now in feedlots, 2-3 years for grazing (availability will increase when the new factory is built)
- **Sensory changes**: no changes to meat or milk



Source: DSM nutrition

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®











Bovaer® and efficacy



Scatter chart comparing the absolute reductions in CH4 emissions (g head-1 day-1) documented in articles published between 2014-2022 separated by animal type.

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®



Asparagopsis

Next steps



Impact of production

- Production & Transportation produces 35-52kg CO2e/kg 3-NOP
- 1g prevents 75g-105g of CH4
- No negative impacts to animals or environments







Source: DSM nutrition & Feng (2020)



The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





Feeding Bovaer® to 1 cow saves the equivalent of 127.000 smartphone charges.

Feeding Bovaer® to 1 million cows is like planting a forest of 45 million trees.

Feeding Bovaer® to 3 cows is like taking 1 family-sized car off the road.



Next steps





Health & safety

- Primarily excreted within 8hr of dosage via expired air (80%) and urine (4.8-13.1%), with the remaining metabolites found in tissue
- Metabolites present no threat to agricultural or non-agricultural ecosystems
- 3-NOP, other metabolites of 3-NOP have no mutagenic or genotoxic potential
- No negative impact on mortality, morbidity or fertility of ruminants has been observed

- consumption

Source: EFSA Panel (2021)

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





- 3-nitrooxypropionic acid (NOPA), a metabolite of 3-
 - NOP, is found in both milk and meat.
- One study found 1 µg/kg and 5 µg/kg of NOPA in milk
 - and meat tissue, respectively, after cattle were fed 3-
 - NOP doses ≤100mg/kg DMI
- The small traces of NOPA residue found in animal
 - products have been concluded to be safe for human
 - But reside in products limits the dosage of 3-NOP
- EFSA Panel recommended 60mg and a maximum of
 - 100mg/ kg DMI in Dairy cattle



Next steps



The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis



Next steps



Further research

Early life interventions

- **18** female Holstein and Montbéliarde calves
- **3 mg 3-NOP**/kg BW (mixed with water)
- Fed for the first **14 weeks** of life
- Supplementation ceased **3 weeks** post-weaning
- Reductions in CH4 continued for *at least* **1 year**
- Not replicated or approved



Source: Meale, 2021

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





Next steps



Australian diets and 3-NOP

- 50-100mg of 3-NOP, 25ppm monensin and 7% fat reduced CH4 by **99% in the finishing phase**
- Over 112 days methane was reduced **78%** on average
- Higher then the **29**% in finishing and **27**% in backgrounding diets observed overseas
- Not replicated or approved



Source: de Almeida, 2022

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis

g/d

Weighed CH₄,





CH, reduction



Next steps





- aka FutureFeed
- Methane inhibitor
- Owned by the CSIRO and licensed to companies
- Sea Forrest (TAS)
- CH4World (SA)
 - Two species: Aspaargopsis taxiformis (tropical) & Asparagopsis armata (temperate)
 - Native to Australia



Asparagopsis armata (above) and A. taxiformis (below)

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis



Next steps





• Number of studies: 5 in vivo, ~30 in

vitro and 2 in silico

- **Cost:** ~\$1 per cow per day (33g per day)
- Method of delivery: mixed in with feed
- **Efficacy:** ~80%
- **Optimal dosage:** 0.2% of Organic
 - matter (based on dried)
- Availability: Now in feedlots, 2-3 years for grazing
- Sensory changes: no changes in taste of meat or milk observed but had darker steaks and higher microbial counts



The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®



Asparagopsis carpospores form Sea Forrest



Next steps



Asparagopsis and efficacy



Scatter chart comparing the average absolute reductions in CH4 emissions (g head-1 day-1) documented in articles published between 2018-2021 and separated by animal type

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®





Asparagopsis

Next steps

piccc

Impact of production

Farming (open ocean or terrestrial)

- Open ocean farming
- 4,623-11,588 ha
- Increases plastic pollution
- Harvests are seasonal
- May exacerbate biodiversity loss caused by climate change
 - Terrestrial farming
- 126-210ha
- Requires more resources and infrastructure
- risk loss of biodiversity
- May exacerbate biodiversity loss caused by climate change

Processing, storage, transport & consumption

- Processing
- Halogenated compounds leave *Asparagopsis* once harvested
- GHG emission from freeze dried or emulsified in oil
- Improper processing can reduce the concentration of CHBr3
- Storage & transport
- High temperatures, sunlight and time reduce CHBr3
- GHG emissions are produced from transportation
- Ozone depletion potential
- stratosphere



Source: Zanolla, 2022

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





- Bromoform reacts with ozone in the both the troposphere and

- 34,000 tonnes of DW would increase ozone depletion by 0.006-0.016%



Next steps



Health & safety

- CHBr3 does not accumulate in the meat, fat, or tissue
- No negative impact on mortality, morbidity or fertility of ruminants has been observed
- Iodine and CHBr3 concentration increased in milk when supplemented at 0.25-0.5% of OM respectively
- 10 out of the 12 sheep examined post-mortem had an extensive area of nodular proliferation and white/tan discolouration, with blunting of ruminal papillae
- 5 out of 10 cattle examined post mortem had haemorrhages, ulcers and blisters



Source: Li, 2018

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis







Next steps



Feed energy otherwise lost as CH4 was partially conserved thus improving feed use efficiency with 26% (Mid) and 22% (High) increases in daily weight gain over the 90–day study period and 53% (mid) and 42% (high) in the last 60 days

- Future feed on Kinley, 2020

Sheep offered various inclusion levels of Asparagopsis had similar LWs at the end of the experiment. Neither the inclusion level of Asparagopsis nor the interaction with time could be associated with LW

- Li, 2018



Source: Stefoni (2021), Roque (2021), Kinley (2020), Roque (2019) & Li (2018)

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®







Grazing technology

3-NOP

- Currently there are no published studies
- There is a MERiL study currently trailing different technologies including lick blocks & slow release pellets
- Further research is needed to determine if it can be delivered through <u>water</u> in grazing systems

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®

Asparagopsis





Asparagopsis

- Currently there are no published studies
- Lick blocks are also being tested • Further research is needed to determine if it can be delivered through molasses in grazing systems









Further research

- Asparagopsis and oil
- Adaptation
- Slow release technologies for
 - grazing ruminants
- Sheep and goats
- Maximising efficacy through diet







"What do you have for planet-warming gas?"

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®







Next steps





The future of farming





Source: The Australian Farm Institute

The problem

The "solution"

Bovaer®



Asparagopsis

Next steps





- https://globalresearchalliance.org/
- An evaluation of evidence for efficacy and applicability of methane inhibiting feed additives for livestock
 - https://www.mla.com.au/research-and-development/reports/
- Use of 3-NOP for methane mitigation by programming rumen microbiome development in calves
 - https://piccc.org.au/

The problem

- Greenhouse Accounting Frameworks (GAF) for Australian Primary Industries

Bovaer®

The "solution"





ainslie@unimelb.edu.au



Next steps





Outputs	t CO ₂ e/farm	Summary t CO2e/farm	
Scope 1 Emissions (on-farm)			HOISPOI ANALYSIS Pre-farm
CO ₂ - Fuel	0.00	CO ₂ 6	Line - on-farm Fuel - on-farm Electricity emissions
CO ₂ - Lime	0.00	CH ₄ 1.707	0% 0% 0%
CO ₂ - Urea	0.00	N ₂ O 133	
CO ₂ - Transport	0.00		
H Fuel	0.00		Fertiliser - on-farm
'He - Transport	0.00		1570
'H Enteric fermentation	1 409	Breakdown of	
'H Manure Management	297.9	CIICa	
J-O - Atmospheric Deposition	15 30	GHGS	15%
V.O. Manura management	1 2 2		
V.O. Animal waste	12.26	746 096	
1.0 Direct fartiliser	12.20		
20 - Dilect letuiser	54.92		
120 - Orme and Dung	54.85	= CO2	Enteric methane
120 - Leaching and Kunoff	48.38	CHA	70%
20 - Fuel	0.00	= CR4	
V2O - Transport	0.00	- N2O	
cope 1 Total	1,839	93%	
	-		
cope 2 Emissions (off-farm)			
Electricity	0.3825		
Scope 2 Total	0.3825		
Scope 3 Emissions (pre-farm)			
ertiliser (urea + Superphosphate)	0.00		
hurchased feed	0.00		
lerbicides/pesticides	5.18		
lectricity	0.04		
uel	0.00		
ime	0		
Scope 3 Total	5	Citation: Ekonomou A., Eckard R. (2022). A C	Greenhouse Accounting Framework for
~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~		Dairy properties based on the Australian Nat	ional Greenhouse Gas Inventory
A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A		methodology. Updated June 2022 http://piccc.	.org.au/Tools
arbon Sequestration			
Carbon Sequestration	0		
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees	0 -21.73		
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees	0 -21.73		
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees Net Farm Emissions	0 -21.73 1,547		
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees Net Farm Emissions	0 -21.73 1,547	THE UNIVERSITY OF	
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees Net Farm Emissions Cmissions intensity	0 -21.73 1,547 10.35	THE UNIVERSITY OF DICCC	S Climate Challenges Centre
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees Cet Farm Emissions missions intensity	0 -21.73 1,547 10.35	THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE Primary Industrie	es Climate Challenges Centre
Carbon Sequestration Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) Carbon sequestration in trees Vet Farm Emissions missions intensity	0 -21.73 1,547 10.35	THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE Primary Industria	es Climate Challenges Centre
Carbon Sequestration         Carbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know)         Carbon sequestration in trees         Vet Farm Emissions         missions intensity	0 -21.73 1,547 10.35	THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE Primary Industrie	es Climate Challenges Centre
arbon Sequestration arbon sequestration in soils (enter if you know) arbon sequestration in trees et Farm Emissions missions intensity	0 -21.73 1,547 10.35	THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE Primary Industri	Image: Centre       Image: Centre<

### The problem

#### The "solution"

#### Bovaer®

#### Asparagopsis









#### Next steps

## Questions





#### The problem

#### The "solution"

#### Bovaer®

#### Asparagopsis







#### Next steps



### Sources

- Ruminal Methanogen Community Changes in Response to the Rumen Development and the Addition of Rhubarb----Institute of Subtropical Agriculture Chinese Academy of Sciences. http://english.isa.cas.cn/rh/rp/201705/t20170518_177188.html
- Development of the Australian Agricultural Sustainability Framework 2021-22. https://www.farminstitute.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/AASF-development-report_AFI_JUNE-2022_FINAL.pdf
- Kim, H., Lee, H. G., Baek, Y.-C., Lee, S. & Seo, J. The effects of dietary supplementation with 3-nitrooxypropanol on enteric methane emissions, rumen fermentation, and production performance in ruminants: a meta-analysis. J. Anim. Sci. Technol.62, 31-42 (2020).
- CN30: Carbon Neutral by 2030 | Meat & Livestock Australia. https://www.mla.com.au/research-and-development/Environment-sustainability/carbon-neutral-2030-rd/cn30/.
- Doran-Browne, N. A., Ive, J., Graham, P. & Eckard, R. J. Carbon-neutral wool farming in south-eastern Australia. Anim. Prod. Sci. 56, 417–422 (2016).
- Chapter 5: Food Security Special Report on Climate Change and Land. https://www.ipcc.ch/srccl/chapter/chapter-5/.
- Yu, G., Beauchemin, K. A. & Dong, R. A Review of 3-Nitrooxypropanol for Enteric Methane Mitigation from Ruminant Livestock. Animals 11, 3540 (2021)
- Consultation hub | Low Emissions Technology Statement 2022 Department of Industry, Science, Energy and Resources. https://consult.industry.gov.au/low-emissions-technology-statement-2022.
- de Almeida, A., Cowley, F. & Hegarty, R. Methane emmissions of Australian feedlot cattle as influenced by 3-Nitrooxypropanol and diet composition | Meat & Livestock Australia. MLA Corporate https://www.mla.com.au/research-anddevelopment/reports/2021/methane-emmissions-of-australian-feedlot-cattle-as-influenced-by-3-nitrooxypropanol-and-diet-composition/.
- Dijkstra, J., Bannink, A., France, J., Kebreab, E. & van Gastelen, S. Short communication: Antimethanogenic effects of 3-nitrooxypropanol depend on supplementation dose, dietary fiber content, and cattle type. J. Dairy Sci. 101, 9041–9047 (2018).
- Alemu, A. et al. 3-Nitrooxypropanol Decreased Enteric Methane Production From Growing Beef Cattle in a Commercial Feedlot: Implications for Sustainable Beef Cattle Production. Front. Anim. Sci. 2, (2021).
- Melgar, A. et al. Enteric methane emission, milk production, and composition of dairy cows fed 3-nitrooxypropanol. J. Dairy Sci. 104, 357–366 (2021).
- Pitta, D. W. et al. Temporal changes in total and metabolically active ruminal methanogens in dairy cows supplemented with 3-nitrooxypropanol. J. Dairy Sci. 104, 8721–8735 (2021).
- Melgar, A. et al. Effects of 3-nitrooxypropanol on rumen fermentation, lactational performance, and resumption of ovarian cyclicity in dairy cows. J. Dairy Sci. 103, 410–432 (2020).
- Melgar, A. et al. Dose-response effect of 3-nitrooxypropanol on enteric methane emissions in dairy cows. J. Dairy Sci. 103, 6145–6156 (2020).
- Kim, S.-H. et al. Effects of 3-nitrooxypropanol on enteric methane production, rumen fermentation, and feeding behavior in beef cattle fed a high-forage or high-grain diet1. J. Anim. Sci. 97, 2687–2699 (2019).
- Meale, S. J. et al. Early life dietary intervention in dairy calves results in a long-term reduction in methane emissions. Sci. Rep. 11, 3003 (2021).
- Schilde, M. et al. Effects of 3-nitrooxypropanol and varying concentrate feed proportions in the ration on methane emission, rumen fermentation and performance of periparturient dairy cows. Arch. Anim. Nutr. 75, 79–104 (2021).
- Ridoutt, B. et al. Potential GHG emission benefits of Asparagopsis taxiformis feed supplement in Australian beef cattle feedlots. J. Clean. Prod. 337, 130499 (2022).
- Roque, B. M., Salwen, J. K., Kinley, R. & Kebreab, E. Inclusion of Asparagopsis armata in lactating dairy cows' diet reduces enteric methane emission by over 50 percent. J. Clean. Prod.234, 132–138 (2019).
- Romanazzi, D. et al. Rapid Analytical Method for the Quantification of Bromoform in the Red Seaweeds Asparagopsis armata and Asparagopsis taxiformis Using Gas Chromatography–Mass Spectrometry. ACS Agric. Sci. Technol. 1, 436–442 (2021).
- Feng, X. & Kebreab, E. Net reductions in greenhouse gas emissions from feed additive use in California dairy cattle. PLOS ONE 15, e0234289 (2020).
- Duin, E. C. et al. Mode of action uncovered for the specific reduction of methane emissions from ruminants by the small molecule 3-nitrooxypropanol. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 113, 6172–6177 (2016).
- Muetzel, S. et al. Towards the application of 3-nitrooxypropanol in pastoral farming systems. in Abstract Retrieved from the Proceedings of the 7th GGAA-Greenhouse Gas and Animal Agriculture Conference (2019).
- Jayanegara, A. et al. Use of 3-nitrooxypropanol as feed additive for mitigating enteric methane emissions from ruminants: a meta-analysis. Ital. J. Anim. Sci. 17, 650–656 (2018).
- Alemu, A. W. et al. Use of 3-nitrooxypropanol in a commercial feedlot to decrease enteric methane emissions from cattle fed a corn-based finishing diet. J. Anim. Sci. 99, skaa394 (2021).
- Samsonstuen, S., Åby, B. A., Crosson, P., Beauchemin, K. A. & Aass, L. Mitigation of greenhouse gas emissions from beef cattle production systems. Acta Agric. Scand. Sect. Anim. Sci.69, 220–232 (2020).
- Beauchemin, K. A., McGinn, S. M. & Petit, H. V. Methane abatement strategies for cattle: Lipid supplementation of diets. Can. J. Anim. Sci. 87, 431–440 (2007).

#### The problem

#### The "solution"

#### Bovaer®



Asparagopsis

#### Next steps



### Sources

- Vyas, D. et al. The combined effects of supplementing monensin and 3-nitrooxypropanol on methane emissions, growth rate, and feed conversion efficiency in beef cattle fed high-forage and high-grain diets1. J. Anim. Sci. 96, 2923–2938 (2018).
- Micrometeorological Methods for Measuring Methane Emission Reduction at Beef Cattle Feedlots: Evaluation of 3-Nitrooxypropanol Feed Additive McGinn 2019 Journal of Environmental Quality Wiley Online Library. https://acsess.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.2134/jeq2018.11.0412.
- Zhang, X. M. et al. 3-Nitrooxypropanol supplementation had little effect on fiber degradation and microbial colonization of forage particles when evaluated using the in situ ruminal incubation technique. J. Dairy Sci. 103, 8986–8997 (2020).
- Almeida, A. K., Hegarty, R. S. & Cowie, A. Meta-analysis quantifying the potential of dietary additives and rumen modifiers for methane mitigation in ruminant production systems. Anim. Nutr. 7, 1219–1230 (2021).
- EFSA Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed (FEEDAP) et al. Safety and efficacy of a feed additive consisting of 3-nitrooxypropanol (Bovaer® 10) for ruminants for milk production and reproduction (DSM Nutritional Products Ltd). EFSA J.19, e06905 (2021).
- Thiel, A. et al. 3-NOP: Mutagenicity and genotoxicity assessment. Food Chem. Toxicol. 123, 566–573 (2019).
- Alvarez-Hess, P. S. et al. A partial life cycle assessment of the greenhouse gas mitigation potential of feeding 3-nitrooxypropanol and nitrate to cattle. Agric. Syst. 169, 14–23 (2019).
- Abbott, D. W. et al. Seaweed and Seaweed Bioactives for Mitigation of Enteric Methane: Challenges and Opportunities. Animals 10, 2432 (2020).
- Machado, L. et al. Identification of bioactives from the red seaweed Asparagopsis taxiformis that promote antimethanogenic activity in vitro. J. Appl. Phycol. 28, (2016).
- Wood, J. M., Kennedy, F. S. & Wolfe, R. S. Reaction of multihalogenated hydrocarbons with free and bound reduced vitamin B12. ACS Publications https://pubs.acs.org/doi/pdf/10.1021/bi00845a013 (2002) doi:10.1021/bi00845a013.
- Stefenoni, H. A. et al. Effects of the macroalga Asparagopsis taxiformis and oregano leaves on methane emission, rumen fermentation, and lactational performance of dairy cows. J. Dairy Sci. 104, 4157–4173 (2021).
- Li, X. et al. Asparagopsis taxiformis decreases enteric methane production from sheep. Anim. Prod. Sci.58, (2016).
- Julião, D. R., Afonso, C., Gomes-Bispo, A., Bandarra, N. M. & Cardoso, C. The effect of drying on undervalued brown and red seaweed species: Bioactivity alterations. Phycol. Res. 69, 246–257 (2021).
- Magnusson, M., Vucko, M. J., Neoh, T. L. & de Nys, R. Using oil immersion to deliver a naturally-derived, stable bromoform product from the red seaweed Asparagopsis taxiformis. Algal Res. 51, 102065 (2020).
- Roque, B. M. et al. Red seaweed (Asparagopsis taxiformis) supplementation reduces enteric methane by over 80 percent in beef steers. PLOS ONE 16, e0247820 (2021).
- Kinley, R. D. et al. Mitigating the carbon footprint and improving productivity of ruminant livestock agriculture using a red seaweed. J. Clean. Prod. 259, 120836 (2020).
- Félix, R. et al. The biotechnological potential of Asparagopsis armata: What is known of its chemical composition, bioactivities and current market? Algal Res. 60, 102534 (2021).
- CSIRO. FutureFeed. https://www.csiro.au/en/research/animals/livestock/futurefeed.
- Seaweed aquaculture. https://fish.wa.gov.au/Fishing-and-Aquaculture/Aquaculture/Aquaculture-Regions/Pages/seaweed-aquaculture.aspx.
- Nilsson, J. & Martin, M. Exploratory environmental assessment of large-scale cultivation of seaweed used to reduce enteric methane emissions. Sustain. Prod. Consum. 30, 413–423 (2022).
- Lean, I. J., Golder, H. M., Grant, T. M. D. & Moate, P. J. A meta-analysis of effects of dietary seaweed on beef and dairy cattle performance and methane yield. PLOS ONE 16, e0249053 (2021).
- Roque, B. M. et al. Red seaweed (Asparagopsis taxiformis) supplementation reduces enteric methane by over 80 percent in beef steers. PLOS ONE 16, e0247820 (2021).
- Muizelaar, W., Groot, M., van Duinkerken, G., Peters, R. & Dijkstra, J. Safety and Transfer Study: Transfer of Bromoform Present in Asparagopsis taxiformis to Milk and Urine of Lactating Dairy Cows. Foods 10, 584 (2021).
- Bolkenov, B. et al. Effects of red macroalgae Asparagopsis taxiformis supplementation on the shelf life of fresh whole muscle beef. Transl. Anim. Sci. 5, txab056 (2021).
- Zanolla, M. et al. Concise review of the genus Asparagopsis Montagne, 1840. J. Appl. Phycol. 34, 1–17 (2022).
- Bridge, T. C. L. et al. Variable Responses of Benthic Communities to Anomalously Warm Sea Temperatures on a High-Latitude Coral Reef. PLOS ONE 9, e113079 (2014).
- Jia, Y., Quack, B., Kinley, R. D., Pisso, I. & Tegtmeier, S. Potential environmental impact of bromoform from Asparagopsis farming in Australia. https://acp.copernicus.org/preprints/acp-2021-800/ (2021) doi:10.5194/acp-2021-800.
- Krause-Jensen, D. & Duarte, C. M. Substantial role of macroalgae in marine carbon sequestration. Nat. Geosci.9, 737–742 (2016).
- Zhu, P. et al. Commercial cultivation, industrial application, and potential halocarbon biosynthesis pathway of Asparagopsis sp. Algal Res. 56, 102319 (2021).

The "solution"

Birgit Quack, Yue Jia, Susann Tegtmeier, Rob Kinley, & Michael Battaglia. Environmental Risk Assessment on bromoform (CHBr3) from Asparagopsis spp. as antimethanogenic feed supplement Assessment Report. (2020).

Bovaer®

• Koenig, T. K. et al. Quantitative detection of iodine in the stratosphere. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.117, 1860–1866 (2020).

#### The problem





#### Next steps